ומה בהמתן של צדיקים –

And what if regarding the animals of the righteous

Overview

The ברייתא taught that ר' אלעזר ב"ר יוסי related that they were once מעלה לכהונה an עבד based on his (ראב"י) testimony. The גמרא challenged this; how is it possible, for we know that Hashem prevents even the animals of צדיקים from causing a תקלה, so certainly he will prevent the צדיק from creating a תקלה. A succinct comment from תוספות indicates that the question of the גמרא is not that simple.

-------------------------

מפורש במקום אחר[[1]](#footnote-1) (גיטין דף ז,א[[2]](#footnote-2)):

It is explained elsewhere in תוספות, when we apply this rule of ומה בהמתן וכו' צדיקים עצמם לא כ"ש, and when not .

Summary

The ק"ו of ומה בהמתן וכו' is qualified elsewhere.

Thinking it over

תוספות (elsewhere) distinguishes between eating a מאכל אסור (like טבל) where we apply the ק"ו, and eating a מאכל המותר in a time where it is אסור (like eating before הבדלה or eating on יו"כ) where the ק"ו does not apply (since it is not such a גנאי). In which category is תרומה לזר; is it considered a מאכל אסור because the זר can never eat it, or is it considered a מאכל המותר (since כהנים may eat it) so it is not such a גנאי (especially since it is a דבר הקדש)?!

1. תוספות explains (elsewhere) that this protection applies only to eating a forbidden food (but not for other איסורים), since it is shameful that a צדיק ingest a דבר האסור. In our case however, even though he caused an עבד (שנשתחרר) to eat תרומה (so it is a case of אכילה), nevertheless the צדיק did not eat a דבר האסור. The ר"ת (in גיטין ז,א ד"ה השתא) is therefore not גורס here this ק"ו of ומה בהמתן וכו'. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. The marginal note indicates that תוספות explains this in other places as well (שבת יב,ב; חולין ה,ב; פסחים קו,ב). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)